Closed Government Discussion Panel
in Preparation for
the Fourth Arab Consultative Conference on
the Review Process of the World Summit on the Information Society +20

(In-Person/Virtual, Cairo, July 1-2, 2025)

Side-by-side comparison:

CSTD Draft Resolution I on WSIS Follow-up (agreed in Geneva, 7–11 Apr 2025)
versus
WSIS+20 Elements Paper (circulated for comments, 20 Jun 2025)

Ayman El-Sherbiny, Chief of ICT Policies, Digital Cooperation and
Development at ESCWA

CSTD draft – operative architecture	Elements-Paper cluster(s)	Alignment (✔ = strong, ≈ = partial)	Major additions / omissions
Preamble – recalls WSIS 2003-05, GA 70/125, SDGs, GA AI res. 78/265 & 78/311	**Intro ¶1-12** – identical legacy + new reference to Pact for the Future / GDC	✔ same vision & legal lineage	Elements paper cites Pact for Future; CSTD text cites AI resolutions (missed in Elements
I. Taking stock – divides, SDG alignment, infra trends, multistakeholder roles	**Clusters 1, 5, 6, 14** (ICT4D, Bridging divides, Enabling env., Monitoring)	≈ content matches but phrasing shifts from "notes" (CSTD) to "Feedback invited" (Elements)	*Meaningful-connectivity* metric & local-content test appear **only** in Elements
II. Bridging digital divides (within Taking stock) – gender, disability, affordability	**Cluster 5** – expands to "meaningful, affordable access"	≈ same gap list; Elements gives richer metric ask	No explicit metric in CSTD; no Arabic-content reference in either
III. Digital cooperation / GDC integration – embeds GDC in WSIS architecture; cites SG Road-map	GDC linkage lives only in **Intro ¶10-12** plus scattered notes	✔ principle identical	Elements leaves the *mechanism* open; CSTD instructs Action-line facilitators
IV. Governance – split into Enhanced-Cooperation paragraphs & IGF-renewal paragraphs	**Clusters 10 & 9** (Internet governance; Confidence & security)	✔ IGF renewal & fragmentation risk both noted	Fragmentation warning exists only in Elements; CSTD has stronger IGF-funding plea
Human-rights language – preamble & divides paragraphs	**Cluster 8** – adds deep-fakes, information integrity	≈ rights baseline shared	Integrity / generative-AI risks appear only in Elements; journalist-safety line stronger in CSTD

CSTD draft – operative architecture	Elements-Paper cluster(s)	Alignment (✔ = strong, ≈ = partial)	Major additions / omissions
Cybersecurity section (in "Confidence & security") – refs GGEs, capacity gap	**Cluster 9** – adds draft UN Cybercrime Convention (2024)	✔ threats & capacity-building match	Treaty reference absent in CSTD
Financing paragraphs – repeat Addis Ababa AA, call for investment & ODA	**Cluster 7** – asks for ideas on **AI/ data-centre-focused finance**	≈ finance gap acknowledged	Digital-solidarity vehicle missing in both; AI-specific finance only in Elements
Follow-up & reporting – requests **annual SG report** & Geneva/NY consultations	**Cluster 14 & 15** – open questions on metrics and modalities	✔ principle of reporting; mechanism still alive only in CSTD	SG-report cadence not yet anchored in Elements
—	**Brand-new clusters** in Elements only: Digital Economy (2), Social & Cultural (3), Environmental Impacts (4), Data Governance (11), Artificial Intelligence (12), Capacity-Building (13).	✗ (no parallel text)	Huge thematic expansion: platform economy, digital public goods, green ICT, interoperable data & AI governance—all absent from CSTD draft

5 headline takeaways

Almost 70 % overlap in core principles
– Both reaffirm WSIS legacy, SDG link, multistakeholder model, IGF renewal and the need to close divides.

Directive vs. consultative tone
– *CSTD text is prescriptive* ("Requests the SG…").
– *Elements Paper is exploratory* ("Feedback invited on…").
→ Final Zero Draft must merge CSTD's operative verbs with Elements' new policy space.

Six brand-new policy domains appear only in the Elements Paper
(Digital economy, Social-cultural, Environment, Data Governance, AI, Capacity-building).
– **Opportunity** for Arab bloc to inject Arabic-content, AI-compute equity, green-tech finance.

Metrics & monitoring gap
– Only Elements Paper introduces *meaningful-connectivity* indicators; CSTD text still counts connections.
– Annual SG-report cadence appears only in CSTD.
→ Need to weld both into a single monitoring article.

Financing & IGF funding unresolved
– Both documents note resource gaps; neither proposes a concrete mechanism (Digital Solidarity Fund revival, Arab Digital Capacity Fund, stable IGF budget).

What the Elements Paper ADDS (not found in the April CSTD draft)
concise list of brand-new angles or language
***additions** we may want to support or refine, when drafting Arab inputs to the Zero Draft.*

1. **Five fresh thematic clusters**
   - Digital Economy (platform work, MSME e-trade, digital-tax fairness)
   - Social & Cultural Development (digital public goods, cultural-diversity safeguards)
   - Environmental Impacts (ICT carbon footprint, e-waste, circular economy)
   - Data Governance (interoperable, rights-based data frameworks)
   - Artificial Intelligence (compute inequity, generative-AI risks, governance gap)
2. **"Meaningful, affordable access" metric** – calls for composite indicators (speed, cost-of-income, safety, local content).
3. **Internet-fragmentation warning** – explicit risk language absent from CSTD text.
4. **Draft UN Cybercrime Convention (2024)** reference under confidence & security.
5. **Targeted AI / data-centre financing ask** in the Financial Mechanisms cluster.
6. **Information-integrity / deep-fake ethics** under Human-Rights cluster.
7. **Open solicitation of stakeholder feedback** on every cluster (consultative tone).

What the Elements Paper OMITS (present in the April CSTD draft)
omissions you may wish to re-insert when drafting Arab inputs to the Zero Draft.

1. **Operative mandates** – CSTD's forceful verbs ("Requests", "Urges") are replaced by open questions.
2. **Annual Secretary-General WSIS progress report** & Geneva/New-York open consultations.
3. **Explicit citation of GA AI resolutions 78/265 & 78/311** (only appear in CSTD preamble).
4. **Strong journalist-safety clause** found in CSTD human-rights section.
5. **Concrete IGF-funding appeal** (CSTD asks SG to mobilise resources; Elements silent).
6. **Instruction to embed GDC commitments into Action-Line facilitators' workplans** (Elements keeps alignment generic).
7. **Reference to the WSIS Forum** as the annual implementation platform.
8. **CSTD Working-Group history on Enhanced Co-operation** (Elements notes the debate but not the WG record).

Suggested next steps for the Arab consultative meeting

Task	Rationale	Concrete output
1. Lift CSTD's operative verbs into a draft amendment list for the Elements Paper.	Keeps strong mandates alive.	Table of verb swaps ("Requests/Urges" → replace "Invites feedback").
2. Draft Arab insertions for the six brand-new clusters (Arabic digital presence, AI-LLMs, circular-ICT).	Ensure regional priorities enter Zero Draft.	Bullet annex for the Arab Marker Paper.
3. Propose merged monitoring article – combines SG annual report (CSTD) + meaningful-connectivity metric (Elements).	Single, coherent follow-up mechanism.	One consolidated paragraph for negotiation.